The College Promise Landscape: A National Perspective

College Promise Programs and Lower-Income Students: Design, Implementation, and Impact
Federal Reserve Bank of Philadelphia & University of Pennsylvania
Alliance for Higher Education and Democracy
May 29, 2019

Dr. Martha Kanter, Executive Director
College Promise Campaign
What is a College Promise and Why Does It Matter?

100 years ago we made high school available for everyone.

This is an update.
The Servicemen’s Readjustment Act of 1944 (the “G.I. Bill”) provides tuition and living expenses for veterans. By 1956 more than 2 million veterans had attended a college or university and nearly 6 million had attended some form of training program.
The Nation's Challenges

- 99% new jobs awarded to workers with some college
- $1.6 T student debt
- 7 M unfilled jobs
- 12x cost of college over the past 30 years
- 14% community college students are homeless
- 13th U.S. world degree attainment
Low-income students often fail to access college, and if they do make it to college, many struggle to afford it.

30% of families do not have emergency savings.

The net price low-income families pay is 56% of their income at a public 4-year and 44% at public 2-year institutions.

Just 14% of low-income students earn a bachelor’s degree, compared to 87% high income students (Dynarski).

The graduation rate for Pell students is 18% less than non-Pell students (Third Way).
Racial Inequities

Even as the nation makes progress, educational attainment remains unequal across racial and ethnic groups.

Today, opportunity depends on learning beyond high school, these persistent inequities harm us all as Americans.

Postsecondary degree completion as of 2017
- 30.8% of African Americans
- 24.5% of American Indians
- 23.7% of Hispanic

In the 21st Century, a high school education is not enough to lead Americans to a good job and a decent quality of life.

Every student should have the opportunity to attain an accessible, affordable, quality college education, regardless of income, race, ethnicity, geography, background, or culture.

The College Promise Campaign seeks to increase the social, economic, and civic mobility of students by advancing College Promise programs in communities and states, starting in America’s community colleges.
What is a College Promise?

- **A COMMITMENT** to fund a college education for every eligible hardworking student advancing on the path to earn a college degree, a certificate, and/or credits that transfer to a four-year university, starting in America’s community colleges.

- **A PROMISE** to prepare students for the 21st Century workforce and the pursuit of the American Dream without the burden of unmanageable college debt.

- **A TRUST** to make the first two years of community college – at a minimum – as universal, free, and accessible as public high school has been in the 20th Century.
College Promise Common Features & Goals

Place-based
  • A college, city, region, or state

Guaranteed Financial Support for College

Wrap-Around Student Supports

Evidence & Performance-Based

Financially Sustainable

Cross-Sector, Sustainable Leadership

Robust Infrastructure
College Promise Designs & Funds Vary

- From Universal to Targeted
  - What institutions and students are eligible and for how many years
  - Full-time and/or Part-time
  - Universal, Need, and/or Merit-based
  - Youth and/or Adults
  - Special populations served?

- Funding Model
  - First Dollar
  - Last Dollar
  - Last Dollar Plus
Each College Promise Program is funded by leveraging available resources, including one or more of the following:

- Federal student aid
- Philanthropic gifts
- Local government and/or education funding
- State appropriations
- Business investments
Aligning & Integrating Financial Resources

Funding Sources:
- Federal Student Financial Aid (e.g., Pell, SEOG, Work Study)
- State Financial Aid
- County/City Operating Budgets
- Local Ballot Measures
- Special Federal Allocations
- Special State Allocations
- Individual Donors
- Foundations
- Business & industry (CSR)
- Native American Tribal Funds
- College Operating Budgets
- College Foundations
- K-12 School District Budgets

Most College Promise Programs use multiple funding sources.
Funding the Promise

Philanthropic Support for College Promise

Business Support for College Promise

Elected Officials Support for College Promise

- East Bay Community Foundation
- Oakland Promise
- Detroit Regional Chamber
- Detroit Promise
- Murphy Oil Corporation
- El Dorado Promise
- Los Angeles Area Chamber of Commerce
- Los Angeles College Promise

- West Sacramento Mayor Chris Cabaldon
- Rhode Island Governor Gina Raimondo
- Tennessee Governor Bill Haslam
In 3 years, from 1 to 24 statewide Promise programs, with more state launches on the horizon!

From 53 programs in 2015

To 300+ programs in 44 states by 2018
College Promise State Impacts

National Landscape
Statewide Promise Programs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Governor</th>
<th>Promise Program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AR</td>
<td>Asa Hutchinson</td>
<td>Arkansas Future Grant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CA</td>
<td>Gavin Newsom</td>
<td>California College Promise Grant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DE</td>
<td>John Carney</td>
<td>Student Excellence Equals Degree (SEED)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HI</td>
<td>David Ige</td>
<td>Hawai‘i Promise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ID</td>
<td>Brad Little</td>
<td>Direct Enrollment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IN</td>
<td>Eric Holcomb</td>
<td>Workforce Ready Grant and 21st Century Scholars</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KY</td>
<td>Matt Bevin</td>
<td>Work Ready Scholarship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LA</td>
<td>John Bel Edwards</td>
<td>Taylor Opportunity Program for Students (TOPS)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MD</td>
<td>Larry Hogan</td>
<td>Maryland Promise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MN</td>
<td>Tim Walz</td>
<td>Minnesota State Reconnect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MO</td>
<td>Mike Parson</td>
<td>A+ Scholarship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MT</td>
<td>Steve Bullock</td>
<td>Montana Promise Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NC</td>
<td>Roy Cooper</td>
<td>NC Promise and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NJ</td>
<td>Phil Murphy</td>
<td>Career and College Promise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NV</td>
<td>Steve Sisolak</td>
<td>Nevada Promise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NY</td>
<td>Andrew Cuomo</td>
<td>Excelsior Scholarship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OK</td>
<td>Kevin Stitt</td>
<td>Oklahoma Promise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OR</td>
<td>Kate Brown</td>
<td>Oregon Promise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RI</td>
<td>Gina Raimondo</td>
<td>Rhode Island Promise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>Kristi Noem</td>
<td>Build Dakota</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TN</td>
<td>Bill Lee</td>
<td>Tennessee Promise and Reconnect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WA</td>
<td>Jay Inslee</td>
<td>College Bound Scholarship and Washington College Promise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WV</td>
<td>Jim Justice</td>
<td>West Virginia PROMISE Scholarship Program and West Virginia Invests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WY</td>
<td>Mark Gordon</td>
<td>Hathaway Scholars</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Recent Promise Legislation
New Promise: AZ, CT, DC, FL, IA, IL, MA, MS, ND, NM, PA, SC, TX, UT, VT
Expansion: CA, HI, IN, MD, NJ, NY, OR, RI, WA, WY
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Detroit Promise</td>
<td>Increase in persistence rate (fall to spring)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pittsburgh Public Schools</td>
<td>High school graduation rates, increase from 63% in 2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dallas County Promise</td>
<td>High school seniors now pledge to attend higher education, an increase from below 30% historically</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kalamazoo Promise</td>
<td>Increase in college completion rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El Dorado Promise</td>
<td>More high school graduates attend college</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tennessee Promise</td>
<td>Increase in community college retention rate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
College Promise Evidence

**EQUITY IMPACTS**

- **Pittsburgh Promise:**
  - 12% Increase in high school graduation rate, and 8% shrink in racial graduation gap

- **Detroit Promise:**
  - 90% students of color

- **Dallas County Promise:**
  - 80% of Promise students are low income, 90% were students of color.
  - 67% FAFSA completion rate, and a 40% increase in enrollment.

- **San Diego Promise:**
  - Increased from 186 students to over 2,000, 84% are students of color and 72% have financial need
  - 9% increase in credits accumulated and GPAs of 3.0 or higher

---

**14 - Bachelor's Degree Completion within 6 years by Race and Gender (2006-2012)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race/Gender</th>
<th>% Eligible for Promise</th>
<th>6-year completion rate for all students</th>
<th>6-year completion rate for Promise eligible</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All Students</td>
<td>87%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Indian</td>
<td>87%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian/Pacific Islander</td>
<td>77%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic/Latino</td>
<td>87%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Indian</td>
<td>73%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>84%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian/Pacific Islander</td>
<td>88%</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic/Latino</td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: The Kalamazoo Promise, updated February 2019
### Why Invest in the College Promise?

**FIGURE 1.1**

Median Earnings and Tax Payments of Full-Time Year-Round Workers Ages 25 and Older, by Education Level, 2011

The bars in this graph show median earnings at each education level. The blue segments represent the estimated average federal, state, and local taxes paid at these income levels. The orange segments show after-tax earnings.

NOTE: The numbers in parentheses on the y-axis indicate the percentage of all full-time year-round workers with each education level in 2011. Taxes paid include federal income, Social Security, Medicare, state and local income, sales, and property taxes. Percentages may not sum to 100 because of rounding.

SOURCES: U.S. Census Bureau, 2012, Table PINC-03; Internal Revenue Service, 2010; Davis et al., 2013; calculations by the authors.

College Graduates

- 24% higher probability of being employed
- 74% less likely to be out of the labor force (neither employed nor unemployed)
- Utilize about 39% fewer government resources (e.g., emergency assistance and jails)
- Report having “good” or “very good” health - 44% more than high school graduates report
- Nearly 5 times less likely to be jailed or imprisoned than those with no college experience.
- Contribute hundreds of thousands of dollars more over a lifetime in local, state and federal taxes.
The College Promise Campaign is a national, non-partisan initiative to build broad public support for accessible, affordable, quality College Promise programs that enable hardworking students to complete a college degree or certificate, starting in America’s community colleges.
Our Work

We convene leaders from business, philanthropy, government, and education sectors.

We share the latest research and best practices to promote high impact policy designs and build financially sustainable models.

We promote and scale Promise solutions for students, families, communities, and states.
College Promise Campaign
3 Years of Outcomes

• Promoted & enabled dramatic increases in local & statewide College Promise programs
• Built national public awareness about the educational, economic, and social need for College Promise programs
• Supported the inclusion of access, quality, and completion metrics in local and state College Promise program design
• Showcased local, state, and national research on the impacts of College Promise programs
• Identified & supported local and state Promise leaders
• Tracked Promise movement growth and reported findings through earned and digital media
College Promise Campaign Highlights

• 300+ local & state College Promise programs in the searchable, accessible College Promise Database, growing exponentially
• A growing College Promise literature (e.g., College Promise publications available on the website to illustrate evidence-based Promise designs, reports, articles, chapters, and policy briefs)
• College Promise City & County Playbook for local and state leaders on best practices for designing quality programs built for equity
• College Promise Research Network advising on quality metrics and models necessary for the postsecondary and workforce success of students, especially underserved and disconnected populations
• College Promise Rural Network to connect rural Promise leaders
• Financial Sustainability 1.0 Report available & 2.0 in design
College Promise Campaign’s Work Ahead

Expand Reach & Impact

- Leverage Promise Research to Improve Policy & Practice
- Build Widespread Understanding about the Value & ROI
- Increase Quality College Promise Programs in Communities, Regions & States
How Do We Better Serve the Diverse Range of Promise Students & Achieve Better, More Equitable Outcomes?

EDUCATION & WORK: Pre-K through Postsecondary & Workforce
- Engage & motivate students & families toward education, workforce & community success goals
- Increase high school and college graduation rates
- Decrease remediation
- Shorten time to postsecondary degrees & certificates of value
- Expand paid internship & employment opportunities
- Promote year-round K-12 & Postsecondary Education

FINANCIAL SUSTAINABILITY
- Lower students’ tuition and non-tuition college expenses
- Implement sustainable financing models
- Integrate funding streams
- Reduce financial inefficiencies & barriers
How Do We Design for Impact & Improvement?

EDUCATION & FINANCE LEADERS

• Leverage Promise research and evaluation to identify what works and ways to increase college opportunity and student success for adoption and scale
• Embed research and evaluation components into College Promise designs to track student enrollment, persistence, and completion
• Contribute to the growing College Promise evidence base to inform local, state, and federal policy and practice
• Use data to improve the College Promise over time
• Promote Promise integration and data sharing at and across institutional, community and state levels.
• Access (e.g., eligibility for youth & adults; sliding scale for Promise scholarships, prioritizing low-income students; simplify requirements; eliminate barriers)

• FAFSA completion, comparison tools for college selection & award letters, make multiple funding sources clear and transparent

• Wrap-around services specifically geared for student subgroups (emergency funds, textbooks, transportation, flexible childcare options, tech support)

• Advising, counseling, mentoring, and coaching services (schedule management, work/student habits, family support)
How Do We Design for Impact & Improvement?

- Messaging about the availability, impacts and potential of College Promise programs

- Curriculum & Scheduling (evening, weekend, and distance learning courses, including prior learning assessments, in clear guided pathways to help Promise student navigate work, education, and family responsibilities).

- Campus, community and state awareness and sensitivity regarding student needs and specific challenges they face (professional development, strategic diversity plan)

- Cross-sector leaders who implement evidence-based policies and practices based on “what works” research
College Promise Goals for the 21st Century

Build and sustain our nation’s human capital, economic prosperity, social inclusion, and productive civic life

• Increase high school and college graduation rates
• Close achievement gaps
• Ensure equity, supporting students and communities historically excluded from the benefits of college opportunity and success.
• Provide sustainable funding
• Implement smart design
Together, we can make the dream of postsecondary education, workforce, and community success a Promise for all.